A list of Working Papers on the last pages

No. 126, 1984

AN EASY FIXUP OF THE FLAW IN LUCAS' "NEUTRALITY OF MONEY"

by

Harald Lang

This is a preliminary paper. It is intended for private circulation, and should not be quoted or referred to in publications without permission of the author. Comments are welcome.

July 1984
AN EASY FIXUP OF THE FLAW IN LUCAS' "NEUTRALITY OF MONEY".

HARALD LANG*, the Industrial Institute for Economic and Social Research, Stockholm, Sweden.

The reader is assumed to be familiar with the papers |1| and |2|. The purpose of this note is to point out that the apparent flaw in |1| is very easily fixed.

All references are to |1|. The "error" consists of the fact that lemma 1 (p.111) does not seem to establish a one-to-one correspondence between $p$ and $x/\theta$. But it actually does, as the following proposition shows:

**Proposition.** Let $p(x,\theta)$ be defined and continuous for all $(x,\theta)$ in some open, convex subset of the first quadrant, and assume that

$$x_1/\theta_1 \neq x_0/\theta_0 \implies p(x_1,\theta_1) \neq p(x_0,\theta_0).$$

Then the converse is also true, i.e.

$$p(x_1,\theta_1) \neq p(x_0,\theta_0) \implies x_1/\theta_1 \neq x_0/\theta_0.$$

**Proof.** Suppose the contrary, i.e. there exists $(x_0,\theta_0)$ and $(x_1,\theta_1)$ such that, say

$$p(x_1,\theta_1) > p(x_0,\theta_0) \quad \text{and} \quad \frac{x_1}{\theta_1} = \frac{x_0}{\theta_0}.$$

Note that this implies $(x_0,\theta_0) \neq (x_1,\theta_1)$. Now, by continuity, there exists $(x'_1,\theta'_1)$ close enough to $(x_1,\theta_1)$ such that $x'_1/\theta'_1 \neq x_1/\theta_1$ and $p(x'_1,\theta'_1) > p(x_0,\theta_0)$. Take next any real number $p$ in the open interval determined by $p(x_0,\theta_0)$ and the minimum of $p(x_1,\theta_1)$ and of $p(x'_1,\theta'_1)$. Again by continuity, there exists $(x'',\theta'')$ in the open segment $((x_0,\theta_0), (x_1,\theta_1))$, and $(x'',\theta'')$ in the open segment $((x_0,\theta_0), (x'_1,\theta'_1))$ such that

$$p = p(x'',\theta'') = p(x'',\theta'').$$

Clearly, however,

$$x'/\theta' = x_0/\theta_0 \neq x''/\theta''$$

which contradicts the assumption of the proposition. Q.E.D.

* Mailing adress: IUI, Grevgatan 34, Str., S-114 53 STOCKHOLM, SWEDEN.
One problem remains, however. The right hand side of Lucas' equation (4.2), being a conditional expectation, is a function of \((x,0)\) defined only almost everywhere. The definition of an equilibrium price function \(p(\cdot)\) should thus be that (4.2) holds for almost every \((x,0)\). The implication of this is that lemma 1 may fail to hold at points where the joint density of \((x,0)\) vanishes.

The easiest way to deal with this difficulty is to assume that the joint density function of \((x,0)\) is strictly positive on some open, convex set, and zero outside. E.g., if \(x\) and \(\theta\) are independent, then each of them should have a density function which is strictly positive on some open interval and zero outside. Whether the uniqueness property of an equilibrium price function holds without any assumption on the density of \((x,0)\) remains, to my knowledge, an open question. We should finally remark, however, that in case \(x=1\) (or \(\theta=1\)) with probability 1, the converse of Lucas' lemma 1 is immediate, and thus Lucas' theorems 2 and 3 remain true in all cases.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.

I am very much indebted to an anonymous referee for this Journal. First of all, he extended my proposition from the case in which \(p(x,0)\) was assumed be continuously differentiable. The proof given here is due to him. Furthermore, he pointed out the necessity to consider the density of \((x,0)\).

Finally I wish to thank Bo Axell for introducing me to the papers \([1]\) and \([2]\).

REFERENCES.


WORKING PAPERS (Missing numbers indicate publication elsewhere)

1976

1. Corporate and Personal Taxation and the Growing Firm
   by Ulf Jakobsson

8. Estimation and Analysis with a WDI Production Function
   by Göran Eriksson, Ulf Jakobsson and Leif Jansson

1977

15. Pay Differentials between Government and Private Sector
    Employees in Sweden
    by Siv Gustafsson

1980

25. On Unexplained Price Differences
    by Bo Axell

34. Imperfect Information Equilibrium, Existence, Configuration
    and Stability
    by Bo Axell

1981

36. Energi, stabilitet och tillväxt i svensk ekonomi (Energy,
    Stability and Growth in the Swedish Economy)
    by Bengt-Christer Ysander

38. Utility in Local Government Budgeting
    by Bengt-Christer Ysander

40. Wage Earners Funds and Rational Expectations
    by Bo Axell

42. The Structure of the ISAC Model
    by Leif Jansson, Tomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer
    Ysander

43. An Econometric Model of Local Government and Budgeting
    by Bengt-Christer Ysander

44. Local Authorities, Economic Stability and the Efficiency of
    Fiscal Policy
    by Tomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer Ysander

45. Growth, Exit and Entry of Firms
    by Göran Eriksson
56. Central Control of the Local Government Sector in Sweden
   by Richard Murray

59. Longitudinal Lessons from the Panel Study of Income
   Dynamics
   by Greg J. Duncan and James N. Morgan

1982

61. Var står den nationalekonomiska centralteorin idag?
   av Bo Axell

63. General Search Market Equilibrium
   by James W. Albrecht and Bo Axell
   General Equilibrium without an Auctioneer
   by James W. Albrecht, Bo Axell and Harald Lang

64. The Structure and Working of the ISAC Model
   by Leif Jansson, Thomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer
   Ysander

65. Comparative Advantage and Development Policy Twenty
   Years Later
   by Anne O. Krueger

67. Computable Multi-Country Models of Production
   and Trade
   by James M. Henderson

69. Relative Competitiveness of Foreign Subsidiary Operations
   of a Multinational Company 1962-77
   by Anders Grufman

71. Technology, Pricing and Investment in Telecommunications
   by Tomas Pousette

72. The Micro Initialization of MOSES
   by James W Albrecht and Thomas Lindberg

75. The MOSES Manual
   by Fredrik Bergholm

76. Differential Patterns of Unemployment in Sweden
   by Linda Leighton and Siv Gustafsson

77. Household Market and a Nonmarket Activities (HUS)
    - A Pilot Study
   by Anders Klevmarken
1983

79. Energy Prices, Industrial Structure and Choice of Technology; An International Comparison with Special Emphasis on the Cement Industry
   by Bo Carlsson

81. ELIAS - A Model of Multisectoral Economic Growth in a Small Open Economy
   by Lars Bergman

84. Monopoly and Allocative Efficiency with Stochastic Demand
   by Tomas Pousette

86. The Micro (Firm) Foundations of Industrial Policy
   by Gunnar Eliasson

87. Excessive Government Spending in the U.S.: Facts and Theories
   by Edward M. Gramlich

88. Control of Local Authority Expenditure - The Use of Cash Limits
   by Noel Hepworth

89. Fiscal Containment and Local Government Finance in the U.K.
   by Peter Jackson

90. Fiscal Limitations: An Assessment of the U.S. Experience
   by Wallace E. Oates

91. Pricing and Privatization of Public Services
   by George E. Peterson

94. Job Mobility and Wage Growth: A Study of Selection Rules and Rewards
   by Bertil Holmlund

96. The Machine Tool Industry - Problems and Prospects in an International Perspective
   by Bo Carlsson

97. The Development and Use of Machine Tools in Historical Perspective
   by Bo Carlsson

99. An Equilibrium Model of Search Unemployment
   by James W. Albrecht and Bo Axell

100. Quit Behavior under Imperfect Information: Searching, Moving, Learning
    by Bertil Holmlund and Harald Lang
102. Collecting Data for Micro Analysis.
   Experiences from the Hus-Pilot Study
   by N. Anders Klevmarken

103. The Swedish Micro-to-Macro Model
   - Idea, Design and Application
   by Gunnar Eliasson

105. Estimation of Wage Gains and Welfare Gains from
   Self-Selection Models
   by Anders Björklund and Robert Moffitt

106. Public Policy Evaluation in Sweden
   by Bengt-Christer Ysander

108. Entry, Industry Growth and the Microdynamics
   of Industry Supply
   by John C. Hause and Gunnar Du Rietz

109. Capitalist Organization and Nationalistic Response;
   Social Dynamics in Age of Schumpeter
   by William Parker

110. A Nonwalrasian Model of the Business Cycle
    by J.-P. Benassy

111. Disequilibrium Economic Dynamics -
    A Post-Schumpeterian Contribution
    by Richard Day

112. Schumpeterian Competition in Alternative Technological
    Regimes
    by Sidney Winter

113. The Industrial Finance Systems; Europe, U.S. and Japan
    by Tad Rybczynski

114. The Microeconomics of Organization and Productivity
    Change - The Use of Machine Tools in Manufacturing
    by Bo Carlsson

115. On the Behavioral and Rational Foundations of Economic
    Theory
    by Herbert Simon

116. Schumpeterian Dynamics
    by Erik Dahmén

117. Micro Heterogeneity of Firms and the Stability of Industrial
    Growth
    by Gunnar Eliasson

118. The Initialization Process - The Moses Manual, Part 2
    by Fredrik Bergholm
1984

119. Forestalling the Demise of Empirical Economics: The Role of Microdata in Labor Economics Research
   by Frank Stafford

120. Unemployment and Mental Health - Some Evidence from Panel Data
   by Anders Björklund

121. Comparative Keynesian Dynamics
   by Richard H. Day

122. The Firm and Financial Markets in the Swedish Micro-to-macro model (MOSES)
   - Theory, model and Verification
   by Gunnar Eliasson

123. What Can Be Learned from the Chrysler Experience?
   by Frank Stafford

125. Estimates of Bounds for Export Price Elasticities in an Underidentified Simultaneous Two Equation System
   by Eva Christina Horwitz

126. An Easy Fixup of the Flaw in Lucas' "Neutrality of Money"
   by Harald Lang

127. Comment on Feldstein and Poterba's "Unemployment Insurance and Reservation Wages"
   by Harald Lang